



**DNA
Subcommittee**

November 15, 2024

Empire State Development Corporation
655 3rd Ave, 4th Floor Boardroom
New York, NY 10017

Videoconference Locations:
9040 Town Center Parkway, Lakewood Ranch, FL
Shapiro Building, Room 5044, 70 Francis Street, Boston, MA
107 College Place, LSB 120, Syracuse, NY

9:07 AM – 11:03 AM

DRAFT MEETING MINUTES

DNA Subcommittee Members in Attendance:

Frederick Bieber, Ph.D.
Michael Coble, Ph.D.
Kathleen Corrado, Ph.D.
Katherine Gettings, Ph.D.
Kenneth Kidd, Ph.D.¹
Jenifer Smith, Ph.D.
Amanda Sozer, Ph.D.

DCJS Staff in Attendance:

Taylor Aaron
Dean DeFruscio
Colleen Glavin, Esq.
Janine Kava
Katherine Mayberry
Shelley Palmer
Brianna Robinson
Lindsey Rockwell
Matthew Schrantz, Esq.
Elizabeth Suparmanto

¹ In accordance with a resolution and related procedures regarding the use of videoconferencing under extraordinary circumstances, which were adopted by the DNA Subcommittee on May 12, 2023 and added to its bylaws, Kenneth Kidd participated by videoconferencing from a private location due to extraordinary circumstances and, thus, shall not count toward quorum, but was able to participate and vote as there was a quorum of members at physical location(s) open to the public.

Other Attendees:

Jenny Cheung – The Legal Aid Society
 Sarah Chu – Perlmutter Center for Legal Justice at Cardozo Law
 Natasha Jean-Baptiste – The Legal Aid Society
 Alison Nixon – NYC OCME, Department of Forensic Biology
 Craig O'Connor – NYC OCME, Department of Forensic Biology
 Meredith Rosenberg – NYC OCME, Department of Forensic Biology
 Martha Saunders – The Legal Aid Society
 Raymond Valerio – Office of the Queens County District Attorney
 Tiffany Vasquez – NYC OCME, Department of Forensic Biology

*Approximate
Video Times*

The Chair, Dr. Coble, opened the meeting by stating that the DNA Subcommittee was conducting its meeting in hybrid with members present both in New York City and virtually. Dr. Coble then conducted a roll call to take attendance and a quorum was established with six voting members (Bieber, Coble, Corrado, Gettings, Smith, and Sozer); one member participated from a private location due to extraordinary circumstances (Kidd²).

00:00:00 –
00:01:09

A discussion took place regarding an additional late document provided to the Subcommittee by the Office of Forensic Services. Dr. Coble then asked for a motion to approve the November 15, 2024, agenda. A motion to approve the agenda was made by Dr. Smith, seconded by Dr. Gettings, and approved with seven votes (Bieber, Coble, Corrado, Gettings, Kidd, Smith, and Sozer).

00:01:10 –
00:03:05

The Chair then asked Subcommittee members for questions or comments on the minutes from the August 9, 2024, meeting of the Subcommittee. Dr. Smith made a motion to approve the minutes, seconded by Dr. Gettings, and approved unanimously.

00:03:07 –
00:04:11

Next, the Subcommittee reviewed Accreditation/Laboratory updates from the Erie County Central Police Services Forensic Laboratory, Nassau County Office of the Medical Examiner Division of Forensic Services, New York City OCME Department of Forensic Biology, Onondaga County Center for Forensic Sciences Laboratory, Suffolk County Crime Laboratory, and Westchester County Department of Laboratories & Research Division of Forensic Science. Representatives from the laboratories were available to answer questions as needed.

00:04:13 –
00:15:57

During Accreditation/Laboratory updates, the Subcommittee reviewed the final documentation from the ANAB reaccreditation assessment activity of the Onondaga County Center for Forensic Sciences Laboratory. The Chair called for a motion to issue a binding recommendation to the Commission on Forensic Science to renew the New York State Accreditation of the Onondaga County Center for Forensic Sciences Laboratory in the discipline of Biology for the period concurrent with its ANAB accreditation to expire January 31, 2029. Dr. Gettings made the motion, Dr. Smith seconded the motion, and the motion was approved unanimously.

00:05:35 –
00:07:22

² See FN. 1 above.

Approximate
Video Times
00:13:12 –
00:15:19

The Subcommittee also reviewed the final documentation from the ANAB reaccreditation assessment activity of the Westchester County Department of Laboratories and Research Division of Forensic Science. The Chair called for a motion to issue a binding recommendation to the Commission on Forensic Science to renew the New York State Accreditation of the Westchester County Department of Laboratories and Research Division of Forensic Science in the discipline of Biology for the period concurrent with its ANAB accreditation to expire October 31, 2028. Dr. Smith made the motion, Dr. Gettings seconded the motion, and the motion was approved unanimously.

The Chair then moved to Old Business. A verbal update was provided by Ms. Palmer on the Partial Match and Familial Search programs. There were no updates regarding CODIS Bulletins. The Biology Technical Working Group (BIOTWG) Co-chair, Dr. Craig O'Connor, provided additional feedback on the NIST Interagency report *Forensic DNA Interpretation and Human Factors: Improving Practice Through a Systems Approach*. During this discussion, Dr. Corrado asked that the Office of Forensic Services provide the Biology Report Standardization document to Subcommittee members once changes are finalized. While no formal vote was taken, no objections were raised.

00:15:59 –
00:23:13

The Chair then moved to New Business. Ms. Palmer provided information regarding the Annual CODIS Security Audits.

00:23:14 –
00:24:22

The Subcommittee then reviewed disclosures from the Nassau County Office of the Medical Examiner Division of Forensic Services. Laboratory representatives were available to answer questions.

00:24:24 –
00:28:26

Ms. Palmer noted a correction to a previous comment regarding the Annual CODIS Security Audits. The 2024 audits were not in person but were paper audits.

00:28:27 –
00:28:48

The Subcommittee then continued reviewing disclosures from the New York City OCME Department of Forensic Biology, New York State Police Crime Laboratory, and Suffolk County Crime Laboratory. Representatives from the laboratories were available to respond to members' questions.

00:28:50
01:31:59

Next, Dr. Coble requested a motion to enter into Executive Session to discuss matters relating to a current investigation or matters that may lead to the appointment, promotion, demotion, discipline, or suspension of a particular person. The motion was made by Dr. Smith, seconded by Dr. Gettings, and approved unanimously.

01:32:00 –
01:33:10

The Subcommittee adjourned into Executive Session with all present members in attendance. Executive Session commenced at 10:40 AM and concluded at 10:58 AM. The Subcommittee reconvened the Open Meeting and Dr. Coble stated no action was taken in Executive Session.

01:35:47 –
01:35:55

The Chair then stated that the next meeting of the Subcommittee will take place on February 7, 2025, with the location to be determined. A motion to adjourn was made by Dr. Smith, seconded by Dr. Gettings, and approved unanimously.

01:36:02 –
01:37:01

Note: Video of the meeting is available at <https://www.youtube.com/user/nyspublicsafety>