



Commission on Forensic Science

June 13, 2025

Division of Criminal Justice Services

80 South Swan Street, Room 118
Albany, NY 12210

Empire State Development Corporation

655 3rd Avenue, 4th Floor Boardroom
New York, NY 10017

Videoconference Location:

445 Hamilton Avenue, Suite 1203
White Plains, NY 10601

9:00 AM – 11:52 AM

DRAFT MEETING MINUTES

Commission Members in Attendance:

Lt. Col. Nicholas Banbury
Pasquale Buffolino, Ph.D.
James Chithalen, Ph.D.¹
Lydia de Castro
Steven Epstein, Esq.
William Fitzpatrick, Esq.
Jessica Goldthwaite, Esq.
Michael Marciano, Ph.D.
Erin Murphy, Esq.
Beverly Rauch
Rossana Rosado
Michelli Schmitz

DCJS Staff in Attendance:

Taylor Aaron
Aaron Cagwin
Dean DeFruscio
Colleen Glavin, Esq.
Janine Kava
Katherine Mayberry
Shelley Palmer
Joseph Popcun

¹ Representative of Commission Member James V. McDonald, M.D.

Brianna Robinson
 Lindsey Rockwell
 Matthew Schrantz, Esq.
 Elizabeth Suparmanto

Other Attendees:

Jennifer Alois – NYS DCJS Latent Print Laboratory
 Julia Becker – New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Jamie Belrose – New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Jill Dooley – New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 John Doubrava – NYS DCJS State Identification Bureau
 Nichole Hurbanek – New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Michael Jankowiak – New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Thomas Leach – New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Andrea Lester – NYS DCJS Latent Print Laboratory
 Christopher McDonough – New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Kyra McKay – NYC OCME, Department of Forensic Biology
 Craig O'Connor – NYC OCME, Department of Forensic Biology
 Julie Pizziketti – New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Meredith Rosenberg – NYC OCME, Department of Forensic Biology
 Raymond Valerio – Office of the Queens County District Attorney
 Tiffany Vasquez – NYC OCME, Department of Forensic Biology
 Christian Westring – Niagara County Sheriff's Office Forensic Laboratory

**Approximate
Video Times**

Chair Rosado opened the meeting by stating that she was attending virtually, and OFS Director Palmer would run the meeting. Ms. Palmer proceeded to take a roll call as members were in attendance in Albany, New York City, and virtually. A quorum was established with 11 voting members (Banbury, Buffolino, de Castro, Epstein, Fitzpatrick, Goldthwaite, Marciano, Murphy, Rauch, Rosado, and Schmitz); (Dr. Willey was not present).

00:00:00 –
00:01:19

Ms. Palmer then requested a motion to approve the June 13, 2025, agenda. Ms. Goldthwaite made a motion to add a discussion on Qiagen as an amendment to the agenda under New Business, seconded by Dr. Marciano. The motion to approve the agenda with the amendment was approved unanimously.

00:01:23 –
00:05:14

Ms. Palmer requested a motion to approve the minutes of the March 14, 2025, Commission meeting. The motion to approve the minutes was made by Ms. Schmitz, seconded by Mr. Epstein. The motion was approved unanimously.

00:05:15 –
00:05:40

Ms. Palmer then requested a motion to enter into Executive Session to discuss matters relating to a current investigation or matters that may lead to the appointment, promotion, demotion, discipline, or suspension of a particular person. The motion was made by Mr. Fitzpatrick and seconded by Dr. Buffolino. The motion was approved with 9 votes (Banbury,

00:05:41 –
00:08:33

Buffolino, de Castro, Fitzpatrick, Marciano, Murphy, Rauch, Rosado, and Schmitz), 1 opposed (Goldthwaite) and 1 abstention (Epstein). The Commission adjourned into Executive Session at 9:10 am.

The Commission reconvened the open meeting at 10:25 am. A motion was made by Mr. Fitzpatrick to send a letter to all lab Directors to ensure they are aware that any instance of dishonesty or gross misconduct must be disclosed immediately and with alacrity. This letter will first be drafted by Mr. Fitzpatrick and Mr. Epstein to then be reviewed by counsel, Matthew Schrantz, before finally being sent to each lab Director in the state and copied to all 62 elected District Attorneys. The motion was seconded by Mr. Epstein and approved unanimously. An additional motion was made by Mr. Fitzpatrick to request one final letter, drafted by counsel Matthew Schrantz, to be sent to the New York City Office of Chief Medical Examiner requesting certain records and information pertaining to the investigation of a complaint, which were previously requested but have not yet been supplied. The motion was seconded by Mr. Epstein and approved with 9 votes (Banbury, Buffolino, de Castro, Epstein, Fitzpatrick, Goldthwaite, Marciano, Murphy, and Schmitz) and 1 abstention (Rauch). Ms. Palmer stated that no additional action was taken in Executive Session.

00:09:30 –
00:18:4000:09:36 –
00:11:4900:11:50 –
00:18:31

Ms. Palmer updated the Commission briefly regarding changes to language on documents received from ANAB. Next, the Commission reviewed the Accreditation/Laboratory Updates. Matters regarding the following laboratories were considered: Erie County Central Police Services Forensic Laboratory, Erie County Medical Examiner's Office Forensic Toxicology Laboratory, Monroe County Crime Laboratory, Monroe County Office of the Medical Examiner Forensic Toxicology Laboratory, Nassau County Office of the Medical Examiner Division of Forensic Toxicology, New York City OCME Department of Forensic Biology, New York City OCME Department of Forensic Toxicology, New York City OCME Forensic Anthropology Unit, New York State Police Crime Laboratory, Niagara County Sheriff's Office Forensic Laboratory, Onondaga County Medical Examiner's Office Forensic Toxicology Laboratory, Suffolk County Medical Examiner Toxicology Laboratory, Westchester County Department of Labs & Research Division of Forensic Toxicology, and Yonkers Police Department Forensic Science Laboratory. Representatives from the laboratories were available in person or via Webex to respond to members' questions.

00:18:43 –
00:27:14

The Commission reviewed the final documentation from the ANAB reaccreditation assessment activity of the Yonkers Police Department Forensic Science Laboratory. Ms. Schmitz made a motion to issue full renewal of the laboratory's New York State Accreditation for a period concurrent with their ANAB accreditation. Dr. Buffolino seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

00:25:14 –
00:27:14

The next agenda item was Old Business. Ms. Palmer provided the Commission members with a verbal update on the Familial Search Program. Ms. Palmer then provided a status update on the DNA Subcommittee Working Groups. Since the May Subcommittee meeting, one representative from each subgroup met to discuss any overlap between the documents and recommendations. In addition, the Mixture Interpretation subgroup has met, and the Human Factors subgroup will be meeting in the next few weeks to continue discussions.

00:27:18 –
00:29:43

The Commission then moved to New Business. From the amendment to the agenda, a discussion on Qiagen was had by the Commission members. Following discussion, a motion was made by Ms. Murphy to send a request to the Biology TWG and DNA Subcommittee to review all the publicly available and privately issued disclosures related to the Qiagen issue and assess which labs in New York are using the Qiagen kits and may be affected, and to report to the Commission any findings. Ms. Goldthwaite seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

**Approximate
Video Times**

 00:29:43 –
00:35:26

 00:34:27 –
00:35:10

The Commission then reviewed disclosures from Erie County Medical Examiner's Office Forensic Toxicology Laboratory, Monroe County Crime Laboratory, Nassau County Office of the Medical Examiner Division of Forensic Toxicology, New York City OCME Department of Forensic Biology, New York State Police Crime Laboratory, Niagara County Sheriff's Office Forensic Laboratory, Suffolk County Medical Examiner Toxicology Laboratory, Westchester County Department of Labs & Research Division of Forensic Science, and Westchester County Department of Labs & Research Division of Forensic Toxicology. Representatives from the laboratories were available in person or via Webex to respond to members' questions.

 00:35:28 –
01:35:28

Ms. Palmer then stated that the next meeting of the Subcommittee will take place on September 26, 2025, with the location to be determined. A motion to adjourn was made by Mr. Epstein, seconded by Ms. Schmitz, and approved unanimously.

 01:36:20 –
01:36:45

Note: Video of the meeting is available at <https://www.youtube.com/user/nyspublicsafety>